Case 3:11-cv-00624-JAG Document 76-14 Filed 12/14/12 Page 1 of 65 PageID# 1558

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA Richmond Division

MICHAEL T. DREHER, Individually and on behalf of a class similarly situated persons,

Civil No.

ons, 3:11cv00624 (JAG)

Plaintiff,

vs.

EXPERIAN INFORMATION
SOLUTIONS, INC.,
CARDWORKS, INC. and
CARDWORKS SERVICING, LLC,

Defendants.

VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF JAMES KILKA FRIDAY, AUGUST 24, 2012 PITTSBURGH, PENNSYLVANIA 2:39 p.m. - 4:03 p.m.

REPORTER:

Ann Medis

Litigation Support From Opening to Verdict

```
1
              IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
            FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
                        Richmond Division
 Δ
 5
 6
      MICHAEL T. DREHER,
      Individually and on
 7
      behalf of a class
      similarly situated Civil No.
 8
                                3:11cv00624 (JAG)
      persons,
 9
                Plaintiff,
10
           VS.
11
      EXPERIAN INFORMATION
      SOLUTIONS, INC.,
12
      CARDWORKS, INC. and
      CARDWORKS SERVICING, LLC,
13
                Defendants.
14
15
16
            VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF JAMES KILKA,
      a witness herein, called for examination by Plaintiff,
17
      by and before Ann Medis, Registered Professional
18
19
      Reporter and Notary Public in and for the Commonwealth
20
      of Pennsylvania, at the offices of Jones Day, One
21
      Mellon Bank Center, 31st Floor, Pittsburgh,
22
      Pennsylvania 15219, on Friday, August 24, 2012, at
23
      commencing 2:39 p.m.
24
25
                                                               Page 2
```

1	APPEARANCES:	
2		
3	CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES BY: LEONARD ANTHONY BENNETT, ESQUIRE	
4	763 J Clyde Morris Boulevard Suite 1A	
5	Newport News, Virginia 23601 757.930.3660	
6	<pre>lenbennett@cox.net (by phone)    Counsel for the Plaintiff</pre>	ï
7	SUROVELL ISAACS PETERSEN & LEVY PLC BY: KRISTI CAHOON KELLY, ESQUIRE	
8	4010 University Drive Suite 200	
9	Fairfax, Virginia 22030 703.277.9774	
10	kkelly@siplfirm.com (by phone) Counsel for the Plaintiff	
11	JONES DAY	
12	BY: BEN KATZ, ESQUIRE	
13	JOSEPH WILLIAM CLARK, ESQUIRE 51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20001	
14	202.879.3939 bkatz@jonesday.com	
15	<pre>jwclark@jonesday.com (by phone)</pre>	
16	Counsel for the Defendant Experian Information Solutions	
17	TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP	
18	BY: ETHAN G. OSTROFF, ESQUIRE 222 Central Park Avenue	
19	Suite 2000 Virginia Beach, Virginia 23462	
20	757.687.7765 (by phone) ethan.ostroff@troutmansanders.com	
21		
22	Counsel for the Defendants CardWorks Servicing LLP and CardWorks, Inc.	
23	Also Present:	
24 25	STEVE SIMAK, Videographer	D 2
		Page 3

	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					
1		* I N D E X *				
2	JAMES KILKA PAGE					
3		6				
4	EXAMINATION BY MR. KATZ					
5	RE-EXAMINATION BY MR. BENNETT					
-6						
7		* INDEX OF KILKA EXHIBITS *				
8	NO	DESCRIPTION	PAGE			
9	1	Experian Consumer Disclosure, Page 3 EXPDREH 000017	5			
10						
11	2	Experian Consumer Disclosure, Page 3 EXPDREH 000037	5			
12	3	Experian Consumer Disclosure, Pages 4-5 EXPDREH 000061 - 62	5			
13						
14	4	Experian Dispute Results, Page 1 EXPDREH 000089	5			
15	5	Experian Dispute Results, Pages 1-4 EXPDREH 000093 - 96	5			
16	_					
17	6	Experian Consumer Disclosure, Page 3 EXPDREH 000117	5			
18	7	Experian Dispute Results, Page 1 EXPDREH 000137	5			
19						
	8	Email exchanges with James Kilka	5			
20		EXPDREH 000143 - 257				
21						
22		* KILKA EXHIBITS REFERRED TO *				
23	3	Experian Consumer Disclosure, Pages 4-5	53			
24	8	Email exchanges with James Kilka	10	İ		
25				Page 4		

```
1
                 (Kilka Exhibits 1-8 were marked.)
 2
                THE VIDEOGRAPHER: My name is Steve
 3
      Simak of Maxene Weinberg Agency. The date today
 4
      is August 24, 2012, and the time is 2:39:06 in the
      afternoon here Eastern Standard Time.
      deposition is being held in the office of Jones
 6
      Day located at 500 Grant Street, Suite 4500,
      Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219.
 9
           The caption of this case is Michael T. Dreher
10
      versus Experian Information Solutions,
      Incorporated, et al., in the United States
11
12
      District Court for the Eastern District of
13
      Virginia, the Richmond Division. The name of the
14
      witness is James Kilka.
15
           At this time the attorneys will identify
16
      themselves and the parties they represent after
17
      which our court reporter, Ann Medis, of Maxene
18
      Weinberg Agency, will swear in the witness, and we
19
      can proceed.
20
                MR. BENNETT:
                             For the plaintiff, I'm on
21
      the telephone, this is Leonard Bennett. My
22
      co-counsel up in Fairfax, Virginia, Ms. Kristi
23
      Kelly, is also on the phone in the background.
24
                MR. KATZ: For Experian Information
25
      Solutions, this is Ben Katz appearing in person.
                                                              Page 5
```

```
1
                 MR. CLARK: Joseph Clark, counsel for
 2
      Experian, appearing by way of telephone.
 3
                 MR. OSTROFF: Ethan Ostroff on behalf of
 4
      CardWorks Servicing LLP and CardWorks, Inc.,
 5
      Troutman Sanders, appearing by phone.
 6
                          JAMES KILKA.
          having been first duly sworn, was examined
                    and testified as follows:
 9
                           EXAMINATION
10
      BY MR. BENNETT:
11
                 Sir, will you please state your full
           Q.
12
      name for the record court reporter.
13
           Α.
                James Kilka.
14
           0.
                And by whom are you employed?
15
           Α.
                Experian Information Solutions.
16
                Where is your office or from where do
           Q.
17
      you work?
18
                Cranberry Township, Pennsylvania.
           Α.
19
                And do you work -- do you telecommute,
           0.
20
      work out of your home, or do you have an actual
      office away from home?
21
22
                Telecommute. I have a home office.
           Α.
23
                And how long have you worked for
           Q.
24
      Experian?
25
           Α.
                Seven years in October. In October it
                                                               Page 6
```

- 1 will be seven years.
- 2 Q. How long have you been able to
- 3 telecommute?
- 4 A. The last four.
- 5 Q. Prior to that, where did you work?
- A. Parsippany, New Jersey.
- 7 Q. And what precipitated the change in
- 8 your, I guess I'll just say, work structure or
- 9 work location structure?
- 10 A. I would call it a promotion and then a
- 11 relocation.
- 12 Q. What's your current job position with
- 13 Experian?
- 14 A. I'm an account executive for our
- 15 information services group.
- 16 Q. And what was your job four years ago?
- 17 A. I was -- the title then was called sales
- support representative, and it's an equivalent to
- 19 a sales associate today.
- Q. All right. And I'm not going to get --
- 21 we're going -- we're going to move through this
- deposition much more quickly than I usually do.
- 23 So I don't need tons of detail, but I've never met
- 24 you before; right?
- 25 A. Correct.

1 0. Have you ever had your deposition taken 2 before? 3 Α. No. 0. Can you explain to me generally what you do for Experian, what your job entails? 5 6 I'm a -- essentially I manage a Sure. book of business, a book of accounts, and my job 8 is to manage the existing business and to, you 9 know, upsell or cross-sell or sell new business 10 into those places I support and also look for new business as well outside that book of business. 11 12 0. And when you say look for a book of 13 business, what are the customers that you would be 14 focusing on? 15 Α. Predominantly banks. There are a few 16 exceptions, a few finance companies. 17 0. Generally where does Experian make its money or at least the money from the segments that 18 19 you're responsible for selling to? How does it 20 make its money? 21 Α. The core of the business would be the 22 credit report data. 23 Experian sells credit reports to its Q. 24 subscribers in various forms; correct? 25 Α. Yeah. That would be the meat of what we Page 8

- 1 do.
- Q. And it sells other products, like it
- 3 might sell different statistical or
- 4 scoring-related products; right?
- 5 A. Yeah. We call that like decision
- 6 analytics solutions.
- 7 Q. And would that be -- when you say upsell
- 8 or that type of thing, would that be the kind of
- 9 additional product line you would offer your
- 10 customers?
- 11 A. That's a good -- yeah. That would be an
- 12 example of it, yes. It could be -- yeah. That's
- 13 a good example.
- Q. But you do not focus on I think it's
- 15 called consumer direct or the products that are
- sold to the consumers whose data actually make up
- 17 a credit report; right?
- 18 A. Consumer direct is solutions that we --
- 19 Experian sells directly to the consumer. So it
- 20 could be versions -- like a version of their
- 21 credit report for the consumer to read. It's
- 22 different than what I sell. That's a different
- 23 division of Experian.
- Q. Okay. And then your -- even four years
- ago when you were in New Jersey, you were in what

- is now a sales associate position. The focus of
- 2 your job would have been the same basic focus as
- 3 it is today, it's just different tasks, but
- 4 selling to banks and other subscribers credit
- 5 reporting data and related products; right?
- A. The sales associate position was more of
- 7 a support role than the role I'm in today and had
- 8 some different focus around training and some
- 9 light cross-selling, trying to secure people to
- 10 report the data to Experian. The role I have
- 11 today is more about nurturing relationships to
- 12 grow, you know, the customer spend and ensure that
- 13 they're happy and that they're -- you know, that
- 14 things are going well.
- 15 Q. Okay. Now, it should be in front of
- 16 you. There should be a stack of exhibits, and I
- don't know if they're -- if it's just all in one
- 18 big stack or if they've been separated at all.
- 19 A. I've got a big stack of paper, and some
- of them are stapled, and one big stack in a binder
- 21 clip.
- Q. Okay. All right. Well, the big stack
- 23 in the binder clip I'm sure, I'm guessing, is the
- one I'd like to start with. And I think it should
- 25 say Exhibit 8.

- 1 A. It does.
- 2 Q. All right. All right. Always good to
- 3 have people that work for you that do their job
- 4 really well.
- 5 So Exhibit 8, your Exhibit 8 I'm certain
- 6 looks a lot like mine. It's a stack of emails
- 7 that Experian in this case has provided; right?
- 8 A. Yeah, fanning through, yes.
- 9 Q. All right. The way -- if you look at
- 10 the bottom right, the way that lawyers and law
- 11 firms deal with papers in litigation is when we
- get documents, before we turn them over to the
- other side, we label them so that they can be
- 14 referenced and they can be tracked and they can be
- sorted. We call the numbering, if you look at the
- 16 bottom right, we call -- where it says EXPDREH and
- 17 then has a number --
- 18 A. Yeah.
- 19 Q. -- do you see that? That's a Bates
- 20 number just for your knowledge. If anyone was
- 21 looking at this, they would -- EXP typically would
- 22 mean that it was Experian produced that these.
- 23 Experian is using DREH probably because our
- 24 client, the one that's suing your client for
- 25 ridiculous amounts of money or whatever, any

- 1 consumer that might be suing, in this case the
- 2 plaintiff is named Dreher, and that's in there.
- And so that's where that -- so I would refer to
- 4 this typically -- if I was looking at the bottom
- 5 right, I would refer to this as Bates number 143.
- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 Q. All right. And then the next pages
- 8 typically are in order, and in this case, they
- 9 are. These documents were -- and Ben and Joe can
- interrupt if I'm misstating the record, but these
- 11 documents, I believe, were produced by Experian as
- 12 emails that they gathered in response to requests
- 13 that we made. Do you understand that?
- 14 A. Yes.
- Q. And the emails, unfortunately for you,
- 16 heavily feature your communications with various
- individuals from CardWorks. Do you see that?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Have you had an opportunity, by the way,
- 20 to go back and -- I don't mean study them like
- 21 this is your final exam you need to pass, but
- you're generally familiar with the subjects and
- contents of your emails related to the CardWorks
- 24 matter?
- A. I had an opportunity to review them.

- 1 Q. Okay. Now, first of all, what is
- 2 CardWorks Servicing as you understand it?
- A. That particular part of their business
- 4 is servicing -- they have outside clients that
- 5 they service their portfolios of accounts.
- 6 Q. Okay. And in this case, is the first --
- 7 I think these emails are supposed to be in
- 8 roughly, if not exactly, chronological order. So
- 9 this one starts September 2010.
- 10 Prior to this, the events that are in these
- 11 emails and that we're to talk about, had you
- 12 already sold some products or services to
- 13 CardWorks?
- 14 A. I had not sold to them. One of my
- 15 colleagues had sold them business credit solutions
- 16 at one point. But, no, I hadn't had any
- 17 particular sales wins of my own.
- 18 Q. So for you they were a new customer?
- 19 A. Right.
- Q. And starting with the first of these
- 21 emails -- and some of them are going to be -- I'm
- just going to roll right through them. And I
- 23 apologize. We just wanted to have a complete set
- 24 for the integrity of the exhibit.
- 25 A. Yeah.

1 But the top part, the top document, 143 2 at the bottom, you were contacted by the woman 3 named Maria Costa, director of credit at CardWorks 4 Servicing; correct? 5 Α. Correct. 6 And had you ever spoken with Maria Costa 0. 7 before this contact? 8 Α. Yes. 9 And how did that come about? Ο. How did 10 that business communication occur? 11 I couldn't give you specifics just because I don't recall, but it would have been 12 13 probably around trying to make new contacts at 14 CardWorks to sell to them. So I probably came across her name at some point, and that would have 1.5 16 been my past contact with her. 17 0. All right. And then she said she needs to be able to pull Bulls Eyes reports on the 18 19 following subscriber code. Do you see that? 20 Α. Yeah. 21 Q. So you received this email. And now I'm on -- the same chain is in the next several pages. 22 23 Α. Right. 24 And you -- so the very next page has 25 your response. It says, "I am sorry I missed your Page 14

```
call today." Do you see that email?
 1
 2
           Α.
                Yeah.
 3
           Ο.
                 It says, "I am sending your request for
 4
      help to out" -- you mean our; right?
 5
           Α.
                Yeah.
 6
                -- "our in-house E-OSCAR experts."
           0.
           Α.
                Correct.
           Q.
                Right?
 9
           Α.
                Yeah.
1.0
           0.
                What does that mean?
11
                E-OSCAR is a -- which you probably know,
           Α.
12
      but is an outside company, but we have people in
13
      Experian that we go to whenever we have or need
14
      support around any sort of E-OSCAR issues.
15
      they -- if somebody would go to -- if we needed
16
      help to get a subcode set up so that their
17
      disputes would come through electronically through
18
      E-OSCAR as opposed to the old -- I think they
19
      called them CDV forms. It's a department of I
20
      don't know how many people that we can go to for
21
      help with this kind of stuff.
22
           Q.
                This is more footnote. It's not
23
      according to the case. You know that Experian,
24
      Equifax and TransUnion and Innovis are each
25
      one-quarter owners in Online Data Exchange, the
                                                              Page 15
```

- 1 for-profit data entity that runs E-OSCAR. So I
- 2 didn't know if you knew that, but...
- A. No, I didn't know that. I didn't know
- 4 that.
- 5 Q. They make money selling ACDs. Whenever
- 6 they send ACDs to furnishers, furnishers pay
- 7 Online Data Exchange money which is an actual
- 8 profit center for each of the bureaus.
- 9 A. I was not aware.
- 10 Q. Joe Clark would have never let that
- 11 evidence come out, but fortunately Equifax's
- 12 lawyers are nice. So in this -- the actual point
- of the deposition and this particular email, you
- 14 would have contacted a particular person at
- 15 E-OSCAR. Do you recall who specifically you spoke
- 16 with?
- A. I don't. We have a general mailbox for
- 18 that group though.
- 19 Q. Okay. And do you know what a Bulls Eye
- 20 is, by the way?
- 21 A. I do.
- Q. What is a Bulls Eye?
- A. A Bulls Eye is a product that we offer
- 24 at no cost to our customers to allow them to see
- 25 what a person's trade line looks like, a

- 1 consumer's trade line looks like at that exact
- 2 moment in time.
- Q. Okay. And then the next email says
- 4 that -- I guess it asks you if Experian offers
- 5 this service. Of course, all three bureaus offer
- 6 the service; right? I mean at least you know
- 7 Experian offers it?
- 8 A. Right. I know Experian offers it.
- 9 Q. So now I'm skipping ahead to -- at the
- bottom it should say 163. It's that email chain,
- 11 the top page which is 163.
- 12 A. 163 you said?
- 13 Q. Yes.
- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 Q. Just several pages in.
- 16 A. Yeah.
- 17 Q. This is a continuation of the same
- 18 chain.
- 19 A. Um-hum.
- Q. And the second page, which is actually
- 21 164, says -- there's an email at 8:29 a.m. right
- in the middle of the page when you say you're
- 23 going to work on it in the morning. And then
- 24 Maria Costa on the response to that says, "Can you
- 25 tell me what functions" -- I'm sorry.

```
You respond and you say, "Maria can you tell
 1
 2
      me what functions CardWorks will perform for
 3
      Advanta?
                I'm getting help from our membership
      area, and I want to be sure that we set you guys
 5
                Will you be reporting data on their
      up right.
 6
      behalf as part of the services you provide?"
 7
           That was your email to CardWorks; right?
 8
           Α.
                Yep.
 9
           Ο.
                Let me step aside, see if I can shorten
10
             What is your understanding of what this
11
      litigation is about, if you have one?
                                              Why are we
12
      suing your employer?
13
           Α.
                Because -- well, I don't know. Maybe it
      would be best if you tell me.
14
15
                We're alleging that the Fair Credit
16
      Reporting Act requires a consumer reporting agency
17
      to -- when a consumer asks for a copy of their
18
      credit report, requires the reporting agency to
19
      disclose to the consumer the source of the trade
20
      line. And in this instance we're alleging that
21
      it's Experian's policy, not a policy that you
22
      deviated from, but one that's uniform to allow the
23
      subscriber to determine the name or the identity
24
      of the trade line that is disclosed to consumers.
25
           So in this case, instead of saying CardWorks,
                                                              Page 18
```

- disclosing CardWorks as the source of the credit
- 2 reporting, Experian disclosed Advanta, either
- 3 Advanta Bank or Advanta Credit Card as the source
- 4 of the reporting.
- 5 Is that in any way consistent with any
- 6 understanding you have of the subject of this
- 7 lawsuit?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And these emails, we can go through
- 10 them, but these emails are going to show us that
- 11 you worked with CardWorks to -- first to open new
- 12 subscriber codes in CardWorks' own name; right?
- 13 I'm not saying the credit reporting in CardWorks'
- 14 name, but the subscriber accounts were actually
- 15 CardWorks subscriber accounts; correct?
- 16 A. Just say that one more time, that last
- 17 part.
- 18 Q. Sure. Experian entered into a contract
- 19 with CardWorks by which CardWorks was provided its
- 20 own subscriber code or codes?
- 21 A. That's correct.
- 22 Q. The credit reporting that then CardWorks
- 23 did subsequent to that contract was made on the
- 24 CardWorks subscriber codes, not on the old Advanta
- 25 Bank subscriber code; correct?

1 Α. Yes. 2 Ο. And in order for that to occur, CardWorks had to enter into its own contract with 3 Experian, its own subscriber agreement? 4 If what you're asking is are they a 6 client, yes. I think -- I'm not really sure where 7 you're going with this. 8 0. Well, actually the remarkable thing, 9 James, a lot of these depositions, I have to --10 you know, I know what -- the one I just finished, 11 I know where Ms. Hughes is going to go, and I got 12 to keep her from going there. 13 Α. Okay. 14 This is -- your deposition in this case Ο. 15 is not -- I don't think anybody here will think it 16 was controversial. And I'm not intending to use 17 it to learn more about Experian's business, 18 particularly in the late day and late part of the 19 week. I'm just sitting here wondering why I 20 scheduled a deposition instead of just getting a 21 stipulation from Joe to this, but I'm here now. 22 So we have in the communications with 23 CardWorks, CardWorks and Experian communicated as 24 to how the trade lines that CardWorks was 25 reporting or was to report would be displayed to

1 consumers; correct? 2 Α. Are you speaking specifically about the 3 Advanta trade lines or just CardWorks' trade lines in general? 5 Well, CardWorks' trade lines in general 0. 6 first, and then we'll speak about Advanta. 7 Α. Yes We would have worked with 8 CardWorks to determine what name would appear to 9 consumers and creditors on that subject. 10 All right. Well, let me take a 0. 11 hypothetical example here. What if Bank of 12 America was your subscriber. Certainly if you 13 brought Bank of America in as a strategic 14 customer, that would be great I'm sure. But 15 assume Bank of America was your client, Experian's 16 And Bank of America said to Experian we customer. 17 want all of our Bank of America credit cards to 1.8 display as Chase Bank credit card. 19 What procedure is in place, to your 20 knowledge, at Experian to determine whether that 21 would be permitted, whether Bank of America's 22 statement that it wanted its credit cards reported 23 as Chase Bank credit card would be allowed? 24 Α. I don't know what procedure is

Page 21

There may be a procedure documented.

25

documented.

- 1 If I were to receive that request I would question
- 2 Bank of America as to why they'd want to do that
- and let them know that the name is supposed to be
- 4 reflective of who owns the trade line. And if
- 5 they persisted and pushed that there was some
- 6 grand reason or good reason why, then I would have
- 7 escalated it to either -- well, I may have gone to
- 8 a few different places to make sure I find the
- 9 right answer. But it could have been compliance
- or membership, one of those types of areas. That
- 11 kind of stuff isn't something that is in my area
- of expertise. That's why we have support areas to
- 13 help us with those things.
- 14 Q. Okay. All right. So I want to go back
- to Exhibit 8. And now I'm looking at page 163.
- 16 Do you have it in front of you?
- 17 A. I do.
- 18 O. All right. The email at the time is
- 19 your response to Maria's email in this chain. And
- 20 can you read the paragraph for me?
- 21 A. Sure. "Since your last client addition,
- 22 Experian has updated policies around who we allow
- 23 this sort of access to. We have two agreements
- 24 attached to this email. One needs to be signed by
- 25 CardWorks and Advanta, and one needs to be

- 1 completed by you."
- 2 Q. And this particular email, I'm sure
- 3 that I actually have a copy of the document
- 4 somewhere, but this particular email didn't
- 5 have -- I don't have the agreement in this
- 6 exhibit. Can you tell me what those two
- 7 agreements were, if you recall?
- A. Yeah. One was a third-party processor
- 9 application, and the other one was a third-party
- 10 processor addendum.
- 11 Q. And what are those documents? What is
- 12 their purpose?
- 13 A. The one is -- well, the one -- the
- 14 application is a brief version of our longer
- membership application, and the addendum,
- 16 essentially it's to give permission to somebody
- 17 like CardWorks to act on behalf of a third
- 18 party -- I guess CardWorks would be a third
- 19 party -- but to act on behalf of one of our
- 20 clients to service their accounts or to perform
- 21 some function like that.
- Q. Okay. If I continue into the email
- 23 stack, I'm looking now at 189 on the bottom. 169.
- 24 I'm sorry. And you have 170 and then you have
- 25 151.

```
1
           Α.
                 They're it looks like meeting invites.
 2
            Ο.
                 Yes.
 3
           Α.
                 Okay.
 4
           Q.
                 Can you tell me what this was about?
 5
                 I don't recall the meeting.
                                               I mean, I
 6
      don't -- this is a couple years back.
                                               I don't
 7
      recall the specifics of what this meeting -- what
      we talked about. Obviously there's the heading,
 8
      but I don't know -- outside of that, I couldn't
 9
10
      tell you.
11
           Ο.
                But it wouldn't have been an in-person
12
      meeting; right? It would have been maybe a
13
      conference call?
14
           Α.
                Yeah.
                        This would have been a conference
15
      call.
             I was out in Pittsburgh at this point.
16
      didn't go out to CardWorks in New York.
17
           0.
                Have you ever been to CardWorks in New
18
      York?
19
           Α.
                Not in New York, no.
20
           Q.
                They have an office in Pittsburgh that
      does collection work; right?
21
22
           Α.
                Yes.
23
                Have you been to that office?
           Q.
24
           Α.
                Yes.
25
           Q.
                When was the last time you were there?
                                                               Page 24
```

1 Α. Earlier this week. 2 Ο. For what? For what reason? 3 To meet with Carson Smithfield which Α. was -- which is a third-party collections company 4 5 that used to be part of CardWorks Servicing. They -- if I understand it right, they're now a 6 7 separate company. 8 But it was not related to this case at 0. 9 all? 10 Α. No, no, not at all. This was a sales 11 call. 12 Q. Okay. Then continuing in the email 13 stack, and I'm skipping ahead to 222. 14 Α. Give me one second to get there. 15 Q. Sure. 16 Okay. I have it in front of me. Α. 17 All right. So I'm now -- if you look at Ο. 222 and 223, and actually you can push both --18 19 discard those and move to 239. 20 Α. Okay. 21 Q. Same email chain as immediately behind 22 it. 23 Α. Okay. 24 0. All right. So if you look at -- two 25 pages in is 241 --Page 25

```
1
           Α.
                 Okay.
            0.
                 -- in this chain. And it begins -- it's
 3
      an email from Brian to a woman named Mabel. Have
 4
      you ever spoken to someone named Mabel --
 5
           Α.
                 No.
 6
           Ο.
                 -- associated with CardWorks? No?
 7
                No, I don't believe so.
           Α.
 8
                She says, "I had sent Mike N" -- and by
           Q.
 9
      the way, have you ever spoken to Mike N for
10
      CardWorks?
11
           Α.
                I don't believe so. It doesn't sound
12
      familiar.
13
           0.
                I think we took his deposition. He was
14
      a third-party consultant that CardWorks used.
15
      he says, Mabel, I had sent Mike N a letter last
16
      week which contained the information that TU had
1.7
      requested from us on the background of the ABC --
18
      are you aware that ABC stood for Advanta Bank
19
      Corporation?
20
                I am, yes.
21
           Q.
                -- on the background of the Advanta Bank
22
      Corporation dissolution and why CWS, CardWorks
23
      Servicing, needs access to ABC's bureaus/trade
24
      lines and that the FDIC will not be signing any
25
      additional papers with regard to the transfer.
```

- 1 The document issued by the FDIC should be
- 2 sufficient.
- 3 You were copied or received this forwarded
- 4 email; right?
- A. Yeah. I don't recall it, but, I mean, I
- 6 see it here in this stack, and I see my name on
- 7 it. So, yeah. I mean, I don't really remember
- 8 getting it, but I'm sure I did.
- 9 Q. In this time period or when -- when did
- 10 you learn -- roughly when did you learn about the
- 11 basic Advanta history, that is in this email,
- 12 Advanta Bank Corporation had been dissolved and
- 13 the FDIC -- or that CWS was trying to get access
- 14 to ABC's bureaus and trade lines?
- 15 A. The first time I would have learned
- 16 about any of this or what happened to Advanta
- would have been when I was first contacted by
- 18 CardWorks.
- 19 Q. Okay. But there was no mystery or
- 20 CardWorks wasn't hiding the fact that Advanta Bank
- 21 was gone; right?
- 22 A. No.
- Q. So then now I'm at the front page of
- 24 this email.
- 25 A. Okay.

1 After you say that you're going to send 2 it out -- by the way, who would you have sent this 3 out to? This letter? Α. 5 On page 240 at the bottom, the second 6 page, you tell Maria Costa, "I will try this out. 7 I am on the phone and will be until 4:30. As soon as I'm off, I will send this over." 8 9 I'd only be speculating, but it probably 10 would have been membership or compliance, one of 11 those two areas, because those are two sweet spots 12 for getting this kind of support. 13 0. Now, I'm looking in the top of this 14 email chain, at the bottom Bates numbered 239. 15 You have a substantive email response that you're 16 sending to Maria? 17 Α. Yeah. 18 Can you explain what you were 19 communicating in this email? 20 Give me one second just to read through 21 it quickly, and I will answer that. 22 what I was telling her is that we want to create 23 new subcode for these trade lines to report under 24 and explaining how we would transfer the accounts

that those -- the Advanta accounts onto the new

25

- 1 subcode and show them as being properly
- 2 transferred on the subcode they came from, the old
- 3 Advanta subcode, and making sure that they, you
- 4 know, started reporting correctly on the new
- 5 subcode. That's what this email is about, yeah.
- 6 Q. And then you say, do you know Gina
- 7 Bennett? She has been working with Kathy Cosier,
- 8 C-O-S-I-E-R, at Experian.
- 9 A. Yes. Yeah. I know Gina, not
- 10 intimately. You know, I mean, I've spoken to her
- 11 the phone in the past.
- 12 Q. Okay. Do you know Kathy?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 O. Who is she?
- 15 A. Kathy works -- well, I think she still
- 16 works for Experian. I'm not a hundred percent
- 17 sure. But she at this point was in our data
- 18 reporting group.
- 19 Q. Okay. Have you spoken to her about this
- 20 case at all?
- A. No. In fact, like I said, I'm not even
- 22 sure she still works with us.
- Q. And now I'm moving into the Bates number
- 24 174.
- 25 A. Okay.

```
1
                By the way, when you say subcode, is
           0.
 2
      that short for subscriber code?
 3
           Α.
                Yes.
                       Sorry. Yes.
 4
           0.
                And can you tell me what subscriber code
 5
      is?
 6
                Yeah.
                        The way I would describe it, it's
 7
      like a footprint or a fingerprint. Every bank or
 8
      anybody, any subscriber, anybody who contributes
 9
      data to Experian has a special subcode just for
10
      them and it ties back to them.
                                       There's also
11
      subcodes for pulling credit reports. And those
12
      subcodes, like I said, they're unique to each
13
      business, and they will appear on credit reports
      so you know exactly -- it's kind of like a unique
14
15
      identifier.
                   Is that clear?
16
           Q.
                It is.
17
           Α.
                Okay. I wasn't sure.
18
           0.
                Now, the second page of this email, so
19
      now we're at 175, it references or it comes from
20
      Experian employee Zoe Zevan, Z-E-V-A-N?
21
           Α.
                Yes.
22
                Who is Zoe?
           Q.
23
                Zoe works in our client -- our sales
           Α.
24
      support area.
25
           Q.
                Okay.
                       She would -- you would handle
                                                              Page 30
```

- 1 sort of the macro stuff, and then she would
- 2 forward correspondence or in this case subscriber
- 3 code details?
- 4 A. That group is -- they're an internal
- 5 resource. And so I would put in a request for the
- 6 subcode to be created, and she passes that to me.
- 7 And then you'll see her emails to me with that
- 8 information. They don't generally -- they're not
- 9 generally client facing.
- 10 Q. Okay. Now, at the top of 176, do you
- 11 see that?
- 12 A. Okay.
- 13 Q. You have an email, the second from the
- 14 top. It says, "Hi, Maria. Any news from your end
- 15 how to move the trades and how to report them?"
- 16 What does that mean?
- 17 A. Allow me a chance to read down the
- string because I'll probably get some context if I
- 19 read down. Give me one second, please.
- 20 So in reading down the string and seeing this
- 21 part of it, essentially I was trying to schedule a
- 22 call that would include Brian Bennett and some of
- 23 the other folks at CardWorks so we could discuss
- 24 when we were going to move the accounts from one
- 25 subcode to the next and just those kind of -- the

- 1 minutia, the nuts and bolts that would be involved
- 2 to make sure that it's as seamless as possible.
- 3 Q. Okay. And what do you mean by moving
- 4 the subcodes, or can you provide some explanation
- 5 of what that meant?
- 6 A. Yeah. I shouldn't say -- maybe I
- 7 misspoke saying moving subcodes. It's really
- 8 moving the accounts from one subcode to the next.
- 9 Q. Tell me what that means and generally
- 10 you're referring to.
- 11 A. In general terms, it would be if ABC
- 12 Bank acquired a portfolio of accounts from XYZ
- Bank, they would need to essentially start
- 14 reporting those trades under a different subcode.
- And so we would, like, mark the ones from XYZ, the
- 16 portfolio exiting, we'd mark those as maybe
- 17 purchased and transferred or something to indicate
- 18 that they were transferred.
- 19 And then the new subcode would show -- you
- 20 know, start reporting the data, picking up where
- 21 that one left off. So you want to make those,
- like, occur in the same month so you don't end up
- 23 having one trade line appearing twice, you know,
- 24 the same data appearing twice on the credit
- 25 report.

```
1
           0.
                Okay. So the example I gave -- let's
 2
      assume Bank of America had credit cards that were
 3
      Bank of America credit cards that had been
 4
      reporting these credit cards and all of a sudden
 5
      Bank of America got out of the credit card
      business and sold all those accounts to Chase
 6
 7
      Bank.
 8
           Α.
                Right.
 g
                What would the process, the proper
           0.
10
      process be to Experian following Experian's
11
      procedures for handling that change?
12
           Α.
                Right, so at a high level, because this
      isn't something that I do, right -- this would be
13
14
      handled by our data reps -- but at a high level,
15
      as I understand it, they would -- we'd coordinate
1.6
      with both banks, and we would schedule calls and
17
      essentially coordinate the transfer, right.
18
      would have whether it was a new subcode created to
19
      handle just that portfolio, maybe to keep them
      separated, or maybe they'd be integrated into
20
21
      other Chase accounts, but one way or the other, we
22
      would close and mark transferred all the Chase
23
      trade lines.
24
           And then on Bank of America these trades
25
      would then become brand new trades, and they would
                                                              Page 33
```

- 1 say, like, that this was acquired or transferred
- 2 from, and it would kind of give some indication of
- 3 the history. And this way, again, so that it kind
- of maintains the full history, the true history of
- 5 the trade line. That's how I understand it.
- 6 Q. Now, I'm skipping ahead to -- at the
- 7 bottom it says 243, which is an email from Brian
- 8 Bennett to you, but it also has a letter from
- 9 CardWorks attached.
- 10 A. Okay. I'm getting there. Hang on one
- 11 second. Okay.
- 12 Q. If you want to take a minute and read
- 13 the email and read the letter.
- 14 A. Sure. Give me one second, please.
- 15 Okay.
- 16 Q. Now, does this -- you refreshed your
- 17 recollection at least somewhat?
- 18 A. Well, so, I don't recall the letter per
- se, but if I had received this, I probably would
- 20 not have read through the entire thing and
- 21 probably would have passed it to Kathy and allowed
- 22 Kathy to sort of respond to it. Because this is
- 23 really like in the data reps wheelhouse, like this
- 24 kind of a notice.
- Q. Okay. And I want to at least talk about

```
1
      some of the substance of it though. It says, this
 2
      the letter will formally -- I'm reading the
      letter this letter will formally document the
 4
      dissolution of Advanta Bank Corp. and the
 5
      assumption of all servicing duties for the ABC
      originated accounts by CardWorks Servicing
 6
 7
      effective August 1, 2010.
 8
           That was your understanding when you were
 9
      going through this September, October 2010
1.0
      subscriber and trade line change; right?
11
           Α.
                Yes.
12
           0.
                And there was no doubt, I mean, or at
13
      least you didn't have any belief that Advanta Bank
14
      Corp. or Advanta at all would be involved in any
15
      of the future credit reporting?
16
           Α.
                Correct.
17
           0.
                Correct?
1.8
           Α.
                Correct.
19
           0.
                And that -- but this letter says that
20
      CardWorks, and I know this is not -- this would
21
      have been data's department, but I'm looking at
22
      the second paragraph.
23
           Α.
                Um-hum.
24
                The last sentence says, "We would like
           Q.
25
      for this new code to report on the consumers'
                                                               Page 35
```

- 1 trade line as Advanta Credit Cards."
- 2 A. Okay.
- 3 Q. And you understood that this was --
- 4 Experian was being asked by CardWorks to report
- 5 the former Advanta Bank Corp. account or trade
- 6 lines as Advanta Credit Cards instead of
- 7 CardWorks; right?
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. Now, let me ask you -- and again, this
- isn't your department, but I'm assuming that
- 11 everything that you're aware of that was done in
- this instance was consistent with Experian's
- normal policies and procedures. Am I correct in
- my assumption as far as you know?
- 15 A. Yeah. As far as I know, I would say
- 16 that we were -- we were doing everything we could
- 17 to address the client's need. So, yes, I think we
- were trying to follow policy and procedure.
- 19 Q. The client being CardWorks?
- 20 A. Right.
- Q. Now, I continue down the email chain.
- Now I'm looking at 144, an email from you to
- 23 CardWorks.
- 24 A. Yeah.
- 25 Q. "Still working on my follow-up. Today

```
1
      your other subcodes show as Spiegel/CWF..." Do
 2
      you see that?
 3
           Α.
                Yep.
                What does that mean?
 4
           Ο.
 5
                I assume Spiegel is a client that they
 6
      service for and the CWS represents CardWorks
      Servicing. So it's sort of a shared, like, naming
 7
 8
      on the subcode.
 9
                And it says that's what shows up to
           Ο.
10
      consumers and creditors. You mean Spiegel
      accounts that CardWorks services report to
11
12
      consumers, credit reports and to creditor or
13
      credit reports as Spiegel/CWS?
14
                Correct, at that time. I mean, I don't
1.5
      know what it is today. But per that email, yes,
16
      that's what it was.
17
                And so you were asking CardWorks if they
18
      wanted to also add CWS to the trade line when
19
      Experian reported to them as Advanta credit cards;
20
      right?
21
           Α.
                Correct.
2.2
                Now I'm at 179.
           0.
23
           Α.
                Okay.
24
           Ο.
                And I have your email that I'm looking
25
      at --
                                                               Page 37
```

1 Α. Sure. 2 0. -- the second paragraph, and it says, "I 3 have submitted a request to have the name changed 4 to Advanta Credit Cards." 5 Α. Right. Right. And so what you're saying is you 6 0. 7 had submitted to the Experian department 8 responsible to make those decisions or those 9 changes the request from CardWorks that it report 10 this portfolio as Advanta credit cards on consumer 11 and credit -- trade line credit reports? 12 Α. Yes. 13 By the way, who would you have submitted 14 that request to? 15 Sales support, not Kathy Cosier's group, 16 sort of the group that Zoe is in. 17 0. Okay. And why would that request have 1.8 gone to sales support instead of to Kathy's 19 department? 20 Because that's the area that makes 21 adjustments to the subcodes as far as that 22 particular type of request, like how a name 23 appears. 24 Who -- I mean, didn't you have to -- if Q. 25 you're following Experian's procedures, didn't you

have to receive approval to report the CardWorks 1 2 accounts as Advanta Credit Cards the way that you would have Bank of America to Chase? 3 Α. So the sales support group actually 5 would be the ones to call us on that and say hey, 6 you can't do that. So they kind of -- like a check and balance kind of thing. 8 Ο. One second. 9 Α. No problem. 10 MR. CLARK: Do you think now would be 11 good to take maybe a ten-minute break? 12 MR. BENNETT: If you want to. I mean, 13 I'm not going to -- you know, we don't have a lot. 14 MR. CLARK: Mr. Kilka, how do you feel? 15 Would you like a brief break? 16 THE WITNESS: I'm fine, Joe. 17 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: It would be a good 18 time to switch tapes. We have 14 minutes left on 19 our videotape. 20 MR. BENNETT: Yeah. That's fine. I 21 probably have 30 minutes total. 22 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Is it okay to go off 23 the record? 24 MR. BENNETT: Sure. Joe, do you need a

25

break?

```
1
                                    The time is now --
                THE VIDEOGRAPHER:
 2
                MR. CLARK: I'm going to go use the rest
 3
      room and get some water.
                MR. BENNETT: All right. I'll be in the
 4
             I'll have the phone on, but it will be
 5
      room.
 6
      muted.
 7
                THE VIDEOGRAPHER: The time is 3:26 p.m.
 8
      Eastern Standard and we are now off the record.
 9
                 (There was a recess in the proceedings.)
10
                THE VIDEOGRAPHER:
                                    The time is now
11
      3:36 p.m., and this is the start of the second
12
      tape in the deposition of James Kilka, and we are
13
      now back on the record.
14
      BY MR. BENNETT:
15
                All right, James. We were -- the
16
      videographer is on the edge of his seat of
17
      excitement as we plow our way through these email
18
      chains.
               I'm now moving up to 198. And we can --
19
           Α.
                Almost there. Hang on.
                                          Okay.
20
      there.
21
                All right. On 198, and if you could
           0.
22
      take a look this email chain and look at your
23
      email in the middle, the October 27, 2010 at 3:06,
24
      can you tell me what this exchange was about and
25
      what you were communicating?
                                                              Page 40
```

1 Α. Yeah. Give me one second. Len, are vou 2 asking me about just this one piece or the whole 3 string? Q. Well, I guess the whole string, but 5 mainly this piece. Actually let me step back and ask you this: To this point in these emails as 6 7 we've gone through them, there really were several 8 different needs that CardWorks had expressed it 9 The initial emails discuss CardWorks' 10 desire to be able to pull Bulls Eyes, and they 11 were asking how do we get permission to pull Bulls 12 Eyes on Advanta's subscriber code; right? 13 was the initial topic; correct? 14 Α. Yes. 15 And then at a later time it seems as if 16 they were attempting to take Advanta's existing 17 subscriber code, but change how the data in the 18 Advanta subscriber code trade lines would display. 19 Am I also understanding you correctly? And then 20 I'll follow up before you say yes or no. 21 Now, in this stage, the discussion is focused 22 on the need for entirely new subscriber codes for 23 And if you can let me know if I'm off CardWorks. 24 track or on track.

That is sort of the path it went down.

25

Α.

```
1
      I don't know if -- looking at these emails, I
 2
      don't know if we're all the way there yet, but, I
 3
      mean, the first one in the string is where I
 4
      created them a new subcode. And then -- hold on
 5
      one second here. Let me just read this, too.
           Then they started questioning me about
 6
 7
      whether there was already an existing subcode they
8
      could use and just have their name put -- laid
 9
      over top o f it or that they could have it put
10
      under them rather, like put under their company
      ID, and I was telling them that's not possible.
11
12
           0.
                      And if you want to skip to 202,
13
      which is the --
14
           Α.
                Okay.
15
                -- the continuation of that chain but
16
      with the later emails. And on 202 you have your
17
      email to Gina that says, "The subcode you provided
18
      is still under Advanta's company ID."
19
           Can you tell me -- I'm now asking you, James,
      why is that significant?
20
21
           Α.
                Because we -- essentially the company
22
      ID -- well, I'll try to think of the best way to
23
      answer this, Len. The subcodes are -- they reside
24
      under the company IDs, and why this was so
25
      important is because we can't move a subcode from
                                                              Page 42
```

- one company ID to another where it changes the --
- 2 like the owner of the subcode. If you were to do
- 3 that, you'd actually change the history. And so
- 4 that's why we didn't want to -- we couldn't move a
- 5 subcode like that. Does that make sense? Does
- 6 that answer your question?
- 7 Q. It does. And then I'm now at the top of
- 8 202. It says, "James, we want the subscriber code
- 9 to remain in the Advanta company ID. CardWorks
- does not own the accounts, they're owned by
- 11 Advanta trust." Do you see that?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. Have you inspected or had an opportunity
- 14 to review the original Advanta subscriber
- 15 agreement?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. But if there's an Advanta company ID,
- 18 that would have been assigned to the customer in
- 19 the -- in a specific subscriber agreement; right?
- 20 A. Yeah. The company ID is more of an
- 21 internal number, but they might not know it. They
- 22 probably wouldn't know what their company ID is,
- 23 but essentially -- they wouldn't know what it is.
- 24 We don't cross --
- 25 Q. Now I'm at 207.

- 1 Α. Okay. 2 All right. And so 208, you've now been 0. 3 told for the first time, I think at least in these 4 emails, that CardWorks does not own the accounts. 5 They are owned by an Advanta trust. Do you see 6 that? Α. Yes, I do. 8 Q. All right. And then you -- in the email 9 above that, you were responding; correct? 10 Α. The email above it, yes. 11 0. You say, are these trade lines still 12 going to be updated by someone on an ongoing basis? Is the Advanta Trust going to be the one 13 14 to handle the reporting. You asked those 15 questions; right? 16 Α. Right.
- 17 Q. Why are those questions relevant or
- important? Why were you asking them?
- 19 A. I wasn't sure if they were closed
- 20 accounts and it was just -- they were going to be,
- 21 like, handling just the disputes because they
- 22 asked about Bulls Eye only originally. So I
- 23 think I'm trying -- obviously this is two years
- 24 ago, right? So I'm telling you where I think my
- 25 mind was.

```
1
           And then as far as who is going to be
 2
      reporting them, I was trying to get a sense of the
 3
      full scope of the relationship so I could report
 4
      it back to, you know, like the membership area and
      the data reporting folks. Most of the time I have
      to get this information and bring it back, and
 6
      then I can come back with what the next steps are.
           0.
                Okay. And continuing, and now I'm back
 9
      up on 207, you have an email November 1, 2010.
10
      you see that?
11
           Α.
                Yeah.
12
           Q.
                And can you read that for me?
13
           Α.
                Yeah.
                       "Gina, I'm engaged with
14
      membership area trying to ensure that you guys get
15
      the access to the accounts that you need to and
16
      one question that came up is who is the current
17
      owner of the Advanta accounts? You mentioned a
18
      'Trust'...do we have a contact at whomever that
19
      trulv is?
                James."
20
                And then they told you it was -- the
21
      owner of the Advanta account is Vion Holdings II
22
      LLC; correct?
23
           Α.
                Yes.
24
                And would you have provided that
           Q.
25
      information to the membership or the necessary
                                                              Page 45
```

departments at Experian? 1 2 Α. Yes. 3 0. Now I'm at 213, five or six pages deep. 4 Α. Yep. I'm there. After you were told that this is -- the 5 Ο. 6 owner of the Advanta accounts is now Vion 7 Holdings, you said, can you have Brian sign the 8 agent agreement and have Vion Holdings sign the 9 open area for client; correct? 10 Α. Yes. 1.1 By the way, I've seen that document 12 I don't know that it's in this stack here, 13 but -- it's not in this stack. But can you tell 14 me what that email was about and what that 15 agreement was? 16 Α. For CardWorks Servicing to handle 17 those disputes on behalf of Vion Holdings who 18 owned the accounts, we would have had to have made 19 CardWorks an agent of the client. In this case, 20 Vion Holdings would be the client, and CardWorks 21 Servicing would have been considered the agent. 22 Ο. And under that relationship, who would 23 Experian have considered the source of the credit 24 reporting information? 25 Α. I'm not sure I can answer that.

- 1 not -- can you try asking it a different way?
- Q. Well, this agreement -- ultimately there
- 3 was such a signed agreement with Vion Holdings
- 4 signing the contract with Experian as client and
- 5 CardWorks as agent; right?
- 6 A. Yeah, one that was never countersigned
- 7 by Experian.
- Q. Okay. Is there a subscriber agreement
- 9 under which CardWorks is making credit reporting
- of these accounts, the ones that had been serviced
- 11 by Advanta Bank Corp.?
- 12 A. Not that I'm aware of. Not that I'm
- 13 aware of.
- Q. So they're operating without any
- 15 subscriber agreement at all or without one signed
- 16 by Experian?
- 17 A. I can only tell you what I know, and I'm
- 18 not aware of any agreement being there.
- 19 Q. Well, other than this -- these exchanges
- 20 here and this -- well, first of all, why was it
- 21 never countersigned by Experian?
- 22 A. We didn't approve the red lines.
- 23 Essentially it came back to us. Brian returned it
- to us with red lines from Vion Holdings' outside
- counsel, and they were not things that we were

- 1 prepared to agree to. And so it led to contract
- 2 negotiations.
- 3 Q. Okay. In this email and the agreement
- 4 that had been proposed or forwarded by you for
- 5 Experian, Vion Holdings was to be identified or
- 6 was identified to Experian as the client, as the
- 7 owner of the accounts; right?
- A. Correct.
- 9 Q. And CWS or CardWorks Servicing was the
- 10 agent of the accounts; right?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 Q. And what was CardWorks Servicing's role
- in this three-party relationship that was to be
- 14 created with Experian, Vion and CardWorks?
- 15 A. I can tell you what I -- how I -- what I
- 16 understood their role to be.
- 17 Q. Okay. I'll take that.
- 18 A. So they were going to be managing any
- 19 payments coming in for these cards, that they
- 20 would be handling any disputes that came in for
- 21 those cards and any -- any other request from the
- 22 consumer, like around address changes or, you
- 23 know, essentially servicing the accounts on their
- 24 behalf, on behalf of Vion.
- Q. Okay. And has -- to your knowledge, has

- 1 Vion Holdings ever provided or made any credit
- 2 reporting to Experian for these accounts, Vion
- 3 itself?
- 4 A. I wouldn't know the answer to that.
- 5 Vion is not --
- 6 Q. Under the terms of this agreement, what
- 7 I'm calling the three-party agreement, the agent,
- 8 client and Experian agreement, Vion Holdings was
- 9 not going to be the entity that was making the
- 10 credit reporting to Experian though, right, under
- 11 that agreement?
- 12 A. Again, this is my opinion -- how I
- 13 understood it. I would have assumed that data
- 14 reporting would have come from CardWorks.
- 15 Q. Now, left out of this discussion is
- 16 Advanta. Are you aware of any contract with
- 17 Experian, either countersigned or not
- 18 countersigned, that remains in effect with Advanta
- 19 Bank or any credit reporting source named Advanta?
- 20 A. Advanta wasn't an account that I
- 21 supported, so I wouldn't have access to any of
- 22 their account information or contracts. So I
- 23 can't -- I couldn't answer that for you.
- Q. Okay. All right. I'm skipping now to
- 25 256.

- 1 Α. Okay. 2 MR. KATZ: I'm sorry, Len. 3 BY MR. BENNETT: 4 Q. It says, James, here is the signed 5 letter from both Vion and CWS. 6 MR. KATZ: Len, I'm sorry. I got to get 7 Mr. Kilka was ahead of me. it. 256? MR. BENNETT: Yes. 9 MR. KATZ: Sorry about that. Go ahead, 10 Len. 11 BY MR. BENNETT: 12 0. It's not attached in this exhibit we 13 sent you, but when it says signed a letter, that would actually be subscriber agreement, the 14 client, agent subscriber agreement that Vion had 15 16 marked up; right? 17 Α. Len, I couldn't be sure based on 18 description of the attachment.
- 19 Q. That's fair. Take a look at 249.
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 Q. And continuing the email, now this email
- 22 chain on the next page, 250, has the conveyance
- email where James, here is the signed letter.
- 24 Above it you say, I submitted the form. Thanks
- 25 for the help. And then on 249, in the middle is

- 1 your email to Brian. "Brian, I sent the agreement
- 2 that you sent back to me to our membership area
- 3 without looking at it. I did not realize that
- 4 Vion crossed out information and changed text. We
- 5 cannot accept the changes without our contracts
- 6 area vetting the requested changes."
- 7 Do you see that?
- 8 A. Yes, I do.
- 9 Q. All right. And this is what you just
- were referring to in terms of why there is not an
- official countersigned document; right?
- 12 A. Exactly.
- 13 O. And then 252.
- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 Q. Again, this is regarding the feedback,
- the middle part of that page, the email from you
- 17 at 11:09 a.m., this is the feedback you received
- 18 from your contracts department; right?
- A. I'm reading it right now. Yeah, it is.
- 20 Q. Now, I'm trying to -- I admit your
- 21 challenge of not having the document in front of
- you, the full document in front of you, but I want
- 23 to the start with paragraph one. The guestion you
- 24 asked was, Will clients affiliate be the party
- 25 solely providing these services? And then you say

```
1
      something similar in that same email bracketed in
 2
      italics, "In the first question, is CardWorks is
 3
      the only affiliate that will work this portfolio
 4
      or will there be other businesses?"
           Do you see that? Do you know what you would
 5
 6
      have meant by that?
           Α.
                Give me one second, Len, to look at it.
 8
      Then I'll respond.
 9
           I couldn't say definitively what I was
10
      driving at there. I may have been asking if there
11
      was going to be other situations like this where
12
      there would be other businesses like CardWorks
1.3
      participating in other portfolios. But I'm kind
14
      of saying this portfolio. So, no, I couldn't say
15
      definitely without having the agreement or --
16
      and/or the attorney that I worked with, you know.
17
      Essentially I was regurgitating what the attorney
      had given me as feedback, so...
18
19
           0.
                Okav.
                       Who was that attorney?
20
           Α.
                Michael Cordova from our contracts
21
      group.
22
                That's it for your emails.
           Ο.
23
                Okay.
           Α.
24
           Q.
                You've broken the case wide open after
25
      that exchange.
                      Sarcasm. Now I'm going to take a
                                                              Page 52
```

- 1 look at the other six emails. If you take a look
- 2 at what's Exhibit 3.
- 3 A. Okay.
- 4 Q. These are excerpts of my client's
- 5 Experian credit disclosures that show Advanta, and
- 6 I picked three because it shows two Advanta trade
- 7 lines.
- 8 A. Are you looking at page 4 of 24 when you
- 9 or is there --
- 10 Q. I'm looking at 3, 3 of 24.
- 11 A. Okay.
- 12 Q. By the way, I know this is not your
- department.
- 14 A. Right.
- 15 Q. But you're able to read an Experian
- 16 credit disclosure; right?
- 17 A. Yeah. It looks a lot different than the
- 18 reports I'm used to looking at because I'm used to
- 19 the client facing ones, but I should be able to
- 20 make my way through this.
- Q. Now, in this instance, I will tell you,
- 22 no one will argue that these are different
- accounts, but there's two trade lines showing, and
- 24 both of them showing the same recent balance, date
- opened and, you know, status dates off by a month.

- 1 But the top says Advanta Bank. It has a
- 2 Springhouse, Pennsylvania address. And the bottom
- 3 says Advanta Credit Cards and has CardWorks,
- 4 Bethpage, New York, PO Box.
- 5 Do you have any idea why there would be two
- 6 trade lines reported?
- 7 A. I'm looking. I'm not ignoring you.
- 8 Q. No, no. I understand. While you're
- 9 looking, the next question I'm going to ask you is
- 10 and then you can answer it first is: Are you
- familiar with the address that is listed under the
- 12 Advanta Bank? Do you know whose PO Box that had
- 13 been?
- 14 A. I don't recognize that address for the
- 15 Advanta Bank, and I really couldn't say looking at
- 16 this why that's appearing twice. It seems like
- it's almost the same trade with very slight
- 18 variation, but I can't -- I couldn't say.
- 19 Q. Okay. I don't have any other questions
- 20 for you, James. I appreciate your courtesy.
- 21 Sorry about you having to wait on me.
- 22 A. No problem. Thanks.
- 23 MR. KATZ: Give me one second. Sorry
- 24 guys.
- 25 MR. CLARK: Ethan, are you still on the

```
1
      line?
 2
                MR. OSTROFF:
                               I am.
 3
                MR. CLARK: Ethan, do you have any
 4
      questions for Mr. Kilka?
 5
                MR. OSTROFF: Not today, no.
 6
                           EXAMINATION
 7
      BY MR. KATZ:
 8
           Q.
                I just have one. In your four years as
 9
      an account executive, how many times have you,
10
      prior to this, had you dealt with accounts --
11
      transferring accounts following an FDIC takeover
12
      of a bank?
13
           Α.
                Never.
14
                MR. KATZ:
                            That's it for me, too.
15
                               I have one other
                MR. BENNETT:
16
      follow-up. Another hour.
17
                         RE-EXAMINATION
18
      BY MR. BENNETT:
19
                In responding to that question from Ben,
20
      roughly, if you know, how many times have you
21
      worked with one of Experian's customers when a
22
      credit card portfolio was sold from one entity to
      an entirely different entity?
23
24
                I couldn't give you a firm number.
25
      I would say it may happen a couple times a year
                                                               Page 55
```

```
1
      tops.
 2
                MR. BENNETT: All right. I don't have
 3
      any other questions.
 4
                MR. KATZ: Thanks, all.
 5
                THE VIDEOGRAPHER:
                                  The time is now
 6
      4:01 p.m., and this concludes the deposition of
 7
      James Kilka, and we are now off the record.
 8
                MR. BENNETT: It's standard buy
 9
      everything. So we don't need anything expedited.
10
      I'm not sure if Joe is going to suggest or Ben
11
      going to suggest is that their client read and
12
      review. We have a stipulation that was in place
13
      with CardWorks, I hope that Experian would honor
14
      as well, if the witness wants to read and review,
15
      then that time period starts when the court
16
      reporter delivers a copy of the transcript to
17
      Experian's lawyer so you don't have to track down
18
      James yourself. And Experian I'm assuming is
19
      buying a copy, is that right? We'll buy the
20
      original.
21
                MR. CLARK:
                           We'll buy a copy, and our
22
      client will read and review.
23
                MR. BENNETT: We'll buy an original, a
     mini and a PDF and then, of course, the video as
24
25
      well. We'd like them synced. We're going to play
                                                             Page 56
```

```
this as the core part of the jury trial, and
 1
 2
      everybody starts to cry.
                MR. CLARK: We will order a copy of the
      video as well. We'd like to have it synced, and I
 5
      don't think we'll need a mini.
 6
           Ben, do you think we should get an original
 7
      and mini.
 8
                MR. KATZ: I'm fine with just an
 9
      original.
1.0
                MR. CLARK: That's what we'll do.
11
                MR. OSTROFF: Ethan Ostroff, can I just
12
      get a copy, one copy condensed version.
13
                 (Whereupon, at 4:03 p.m., the taking of
14
      the instant deposition ceased.)
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
                                                              Page 57
```

1	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA ) CERTIFICATE
2	COUNTY OF ALLEGHENY ) SS:
3	I, Ann Medis, RPR, a Court Reporter and
4	Notary Public in and for the Commonwealth of
5	Pennsylvania, hereby certify the witness, JAMES
б	KILKA, was by me first duly sworn to testify to
7	the truth; the foregoing deposition was taken at
8	the time and place stated herein; and the said
9	deposition was recorded stenographically by me and
10	then reduced to printing under my direction, and
11	constitutes a true record of the testimony given
12	by said witness.
13	I certify the inspection, reading and signing
14	of said deposition were NOT waived by counsel for
15	the respective parties and by the witness.
16	I certify I am not a relative or employee of
17	any of the parties, or a relative or employee of
18	either counsel, and I am in no way interested
19	directly or indirectly in this action.
20	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
21	hand and affixed my seal of office this 6th day of
22	September, 2012.
23	
24	Notach Public
25	
	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA  Notarial Susi  Ann Media, Notary Public

Ann Medis, Notary Public City of Pittsburgh, Allegheny County My Commission Expires Jan. 7, 2013 Member, Pennsylvania Association of Notaries

		Page 59
1	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA ) ERRATA	
2	COUNTY OF ALLEGHENY ) SHEET	
3		
4	I, JAMES KILKA, have read the foregoing pages of	
5	my deposition given on August 24, 2012, and wish	
6.	to make the following, if any, amendments,	
7	additions, deletions or corrections:	
8		
9	Page Line Change and reason for change:	
10	49 5 "Vion is not" should read "Vionn is	
11	not my Client" Reason: Either I was cut off or the reporter misheard my	
12	answer."	
13		
14		
15		
16	In all other respects, the transcript is	
17	true and correct.	
18		
19	Jonnes Keelen	
20	JAMES KILKA	
21	And Address State of State And	
22	3rd day of October, 2012.	
23	COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA	
24	Megan A. Leese, Notary Public Cranberry Twp., Butler County	
25	Notary Public MEMBER, PENNSYLVANIA ASSOCIATION OF NOTARIES	

attachment 50:18

<b>A</b>
ABC 26:17,18 32:11
35:5
ABC's 26:23 27:14
able 7:2 14:18 41:10
53:15,19
accept 51:5
access 22:23 26:23
27:13 45:15 49:21
account 7:14 36:5
45;21 49:20,22 55:9 accounts 8:7 13:5
19:14,15 23:20 28:24
28:25 31:24 32:8,12
33:6,21 35:6 37:11
39:2 43:10 44:4,20
45:15,17 46:6,18
47:10 48:7,10,23 49:2
53:23 55:10,11
ACDs 16:5,6
acquired 32:12 34:1 act 18:16 23:17,19
action 58:19
actual 6:20 16:7,12
add 37:18
addendum 23:10,15
addition 22:21
additional 9:9 26:25
additions 59:7
address 36:17 48:22
54:2,11,14 adjustments 38:21
admit 51:20
Advanta 18:3 19:2,3,3
19:24 21:3,6 22:25
26:18,21 27:11,12,16
27:20 28:25 29:3
35:4,13,14 36:1,5,6 37:19 38:4,10 39:2 41:18 43:9,11,14,17
37:19 38:4,10 39:2
41:18 43:9,11,14,17
44:5,13 45:17,21 46:6 47:11 49:16,18,19,20
53:5,6 54:1,3,12,15
Advanta's 41:12,16
42:18
affiliate 51:24 52:3
affixed 58:21
afternoon 5:5
agency 5:3,18 18:16,18
agent 46:8,19,21 47:5 48:10 49:7 50:15
4X+1114Q+750+15
ago 7:16 9:25 44:24
ago 7:16 9:25 44:24 agree 48:1
ago 7:16 9:25 44:24 agree 48:1 agreement 20:4 23:5
ago 7:16 9:25 44:24 agree 48:1 agreement 20:4 23:5 43:15,19 46:8,15 47:2
ago 7:16 9:25 44:24 agree 48:1 agreement 20:4 23:5

```
51:1 52:15
agreements 22:23 23:7
ahead 17:9 25:13 34:6
  50:7,9
al 5:11
ALLEGHENY 58:2
  59:2
alleging 18:15.20
allow 16:24 18:22
  22:22 31:17
allowed 21:23 34:21
amendments 59:6
America 21:12,13,15
  21:16,17 22:2 33:2,3
  33:5,24 39:3
America's 21:21
amounts 11:25
analytics 9:6
and/or 52:16
Ann 1:25 2:18 5:17
  58:3
answer 22:9 28:21
  42:23 43:6 46:25
  49:4.23 54:10
ANTHONY 3:3
anybody 20:15 30:8,8
apologize 13:23
appear 21:8-30:13
APPEARANCES 3:1
appearing 5:25 6:2,5
  32:23,24 54:16
appears 38:23
application 23:9,14,15
appreciate 54:20
approval 39:1
approve 47:22
area 18:4 22:11 30:24
 38:20 45:4,14 46:9
 51:2.6
areas 22:10,12 28:11
argue 53:22
aside 18:9
asked 36:4 44:14,22
  51:24
asking 20:5 37:17 41:2
 41:11 42:19 44:18
 47:1 52:10
asks 17:4 18:17
assigned 43:18
associate 7:19 10:1,6
associated 26:6
ASSOCIATES 3:2
assume 21:15 33:2 37:5
assumed 49:13
assuming 36:10 56:18
assumption 35:5 36:14
attached 22:24 34:9
  50:12
```

attempting 41:16 attorney 52:16,17,19 attorneys 5:15 August 1:18 2:22 5:4 35:7 59:5 Avenue 3:13,18 aware 16:9 26:18 36:11 47:12.13.18 49:16 a.m 17:21 51:17 В back 12:20 22:14 24:6 30:10 40:13 41:5 45:4,6,7,8 47:23 51:2 background 5:23 26:17 26:21 balance 39:7 53:24 bank 2:21 19:3.25 21:11,13,15,16,17,18 21:21.23 22:2 26:18 26:21 27:12,20 30:7 32:12,13 33:2,3,5,7 33:24 35:4,13 36:5 39:3 47:11 49:19 54:1,12,15 55:12 banks 8:15 10:4 33:16 based 50:17 basic 10:2 27:11 basis 44:13 Bates 11:19 12:5 28:14 29:23 Beach 3:19 begins 26:2 behalf 1:7 2:7 6:3 18:6 23:17,19 46:17 48:24 48:24 belief 35:13 believe 12:11 26:7.11 Ben 3:12 5:25 12:9 55:19 56:10 57:6 Bennett 3:3 4:3.5 5:20 5:21 6:10 29:7 31:22 34:8 39:12,20,24 40:4 40:14 50:3,8,11 55:15 55:18 56:2,8.23 best 18:14 42:22 Bethpage 54:4 big 10:18,19,20,22 binder 10:20,23 bkatz@jonesday.com 3:14 **bolts** 32:1 book 8:7,7,11,12 bottom 11:10,16 12:4 14:2 17:10 23:23 28:5,14 34:7 54:2

Box 54:4.12 bracketed 52:1 brand 33:25 break 39:11,15,25 Brian 26:3 31:22 34:7 46:7 47:23 51:1,1 brief 23:14 39:15 **bring** 45:6 broken 52:24 brought 21:13 Bulls 14:18 16:19,22,23 41:10.11 44:22 bureaus 16:8 17:5 27:14 bureaus/trade 26:23 business 8:7,8,9,11,11 8:13,21 13:3,15 14:10 20:17 30:13 33:6 businesses 52:4,12 buy 56:8.19.21.23 **buving** 56:19 CAHOON 3:7 call 7:10 9:5 11:15,16 15:1 24:13,15 25:11 31:22 39:5 called 2:17 7:17 9:15 15:19 calling 49:7 calls 33:16 caption 5:9 card 19:3 21:18,23 33:5 55:22 cards 21:17,22 33:2,3,4 36:1,6 37:19 38:4,10 39:2 48:19,21 54:3 **CardWorks** 1:12,12 2:12,12 3:21,22 6:4,4 12:17,23 13:2,13 14:3 14:14 18:2,7,25 19:1 19:11,12,13,15,19,19 19:22,24 20:3,23,23 20:24 21:3,5,8 22:25 23:17.18 24:16.17 25:5 26:6,10,14,22 27:18,20 31:23 34:9 35:6,20 36:4,7,19,23 37:6,11,17 38:9 39:1 41:8,9,23 43:9 44:4 46:16,19,20 47:5,9 48:9.12.14 49:14 52:2 52:12 54:3 56:13 Carson 25:3 case 5:9 11:7 12:1,8 13:6 15:23 18:25 20:14 25:8 29:20 31:2 46:19 52:24

CDV 15:19 ceased 57:14 center 2:21 16:8 Central 3:18 certain 11:5 Certainly 21:12 **CERTIFICATE 58:1** certify 58:5.13.16 chain 14:22 17:10.18 22:19 25:21 26:2 28:14 36:21 40:22 42:15 50:22 **chains** 40:18 challenge 51:21 **chance** 31:17 change 7:7 33:11 35:10 41:17 43:3 59:9,9 changed 38:3 51:4 changes 38:9 43:1 48:22 51:5.6 Chase 21:18,23 33:6,21 33:22 39:3 check 39:7 chronological 13:8 Civil 1:7 2:7 Clark 3:12 6:1,1 16:10 39:10,14 40:2 54:25 55:3 56:21 57:3,10 class 1:7 2:7 clear 30:15 client 11:24.24 20:6 21:15 22:21 30:23 31:9 36:19 37:5 46:9 46:19,20 47:4 48:6 49:8 50:15 53:19 56:11.22 clients 13:4 23:20 51:24 client's 36:17 53:4 clip 10:21,23 close 33:22 closed 44:19 Clyde 3:3 **code** 14:19 19:20,25 30:2,4 31:3 35:25 41:12,17,18 43:8 codes 19:12,20,24 41:22 colleagues 13:15 collection 24:21 collections 25:4 come 14:9 15:17 16:11 45:7 49:14 comes 30:19 coming 48:19 commencing 2:23 Commonwealth 2:19

58:1,4 59:1

Boulevard 3:3

21:20 22:22 29:8,16
30:9,20 33:10 36:4
37:19 38:7 46:1,23
47:4,7,16,21 48:5,6
48:14 49:2,8,10,17
53:5,15 56:13,18
Experian's 18:21 20:17
21:15 33:10 36:12
38:25 55:21 56:17
expertise 22:12
experts 15:6
explain 8:4 28:18
explaining 28:24
explanation 32:4
expressed 41:8
Eye 16:19,22,23 44:22
Eyes 14:18 41:10,12
E-OSCAR 15:6,11,14
15:18 16:1,15

## $\mathbf{F}$ f 42:9 facing 31:9 53:19 fact 27:20 29:21 fair 18:15 50:19 Fairfax 3:9 5:22 familiar 12:22 26:12 54:11 fanning 11:8 far 36:14,15 38:21 45:1 FDIC 26:24 27:1,13 55:11 feature 12:16 feedback 51:15,17 52:18 feel 39:14 final 12:21 finance 8:16 find 22:8 fine 39:16,20 57:8 fingerprint 30:7 finished 20:10 firm 55:24 firms 11:11 first 6:7 13:1,6,20 19:11 21:6 27:15,17 42:3 44:3 47:20 52:2 54:10 58:6 five 46:3 Floor 2:21 focus 9:14 10:1,2,8 focused 41:21 focusing 8:14 folks 31:23 45:5 follow 36:18 41:20 following 14:19 33:10

38:25 55:11 59:6

follows 6:8

```
follow-up 36:25 55:16
footnote 15:22
footprint 30:7
foregoing 58:7 59:4
form 50:24
formally 35:2,3
former 36:5
forms 8:24 15:19
fortunately 16:11
forward 31:2
forwarded 27:3 48:4
for-profit 16:1
four 7:4.16 9:24 55:8
Friday 1:18 2:22
front 10:15 22:16 25:16
  27:23 51:21,22
full 6:11 34:4 45:3
  51:22
function 23:21
functions 17:25 18:2
furnishers 16:6.6
future 35:15
```

 $\mathbf{G}$ G3:18gathered 12:12 general 16:17 21:4,5 32:11 generally 8:4,17 12:22 31:8,9 32:9 getting 18:3 20:20 27:8 28:12 34:10 Gina 29:6.9 42:17 45:13 give 14:11 23:16 25:14 28:20 31:19 34:2,14 41:1 52:7 54:23 55:24 given 52:18 58:11 59:5 go 12:20 15:13,15,20 19:9 20:11 22:14 24:16 39:22 40:2 50:9 going 7:20,21,21 10:14 13:21,22 17:23 19:10 20:7,11,12 28:1 31:24 35:9 39:13 40:2 44:12,13,20 45:1 48:18 49:9 52:11,25 54:9 56:10,11,25 good 9:11,13 11:2 22:6 39:11,17 grand 22:6 Grant 5:7 great 21:14

group 7:15 16:18 29:18

31:4 38:15,16 39:4

52:21

grow 10:12 guess 7:8 17:4 23:18 41:4 guessing 10:23 guys 18:4 45:14 54:24 H H 59:2 hand 58:21 handle 30:25 33:19 44:14 46:16 handled 33:14 handling 33:11 44:21 48:20 Hang 34:10 40:19

handle 30:25 33:19 handling 33:11 44:21 happen 55:25 happened 27:16 happy 10:13 heading 24:8 heavily 12:16 held 5:6 help 15:4,16,21 18:3 22:13 50:25 hereunto 58:20 hey 39:5 Hi 31:14 hiding 27:20 high 33:12,14 history 27:11 34:3,4,4 43:3 hold 42:4 Holdings 45:21 46:7.8 46:17,20 47:3,24 48:5 49:1.8

46:17,20 47:3,24 49:1,8 home 6:20,21,22 honor 56:13 hope 56:13 hour 55:16 Hughes 20:11 hundred 29:16 hypothetical 21:11

I ID 42:11,18,22 43:1,9 43:17,20,22 idea 54:5 identified 48:5.6 identifier 30:15 identify 5:15 identity 18:23 **IDs** 42:24 ignoring 54:7 II 45:21 immediately 25:21 important 42:25 44:18 include 31:22 **Incorporated 5:11** INDEX 4:7

indicate 32:17 indication 34:2 indirectly 58:19 Individually 1:6 2:6 individuals 12:17 **information** 1:11 2:11 3:16 5:10.24 6:15 7:15 26:16 31:8 45:6 45:25 46:24 49:22 51:4 initial 41:9.13 Innovis 15:24 inspected 43:13 inspection 58:13 instance 18:20 36:12 53:21 instant 57:14 integrated 33:20 integrity 13:24 intending 20:16 interested 58:18 internal 31:4 43:21 interrupt 12:10 intimately 29:10 invites 24:1 involved 32:1 35:14 in-house 15:6 in-person 24:11 ISÄACS 3:7 issued 27:1 issues 15:14 italics 52:2

James 1:17 2:16 4:2,19 4:24 5:14 6:6,13 20:9 40:12,15 42:19 43:8 45:19 50:4,23 54:20 56:7,18 58:5 59:4,20 Jersey 7:6 9:25 iob 7:12.16 8:5.7 10:2 11:3 Joe 12:9 16:10 20:21 39:16,24 56:10 Jones 2:20 3:11 5:6 Joseph 3:12 6:1 jury 57:1 jwclark@jonesday.c... 3:15 K

J 3:3

**JAG** 1:8 2:8

K Kathy 29:7,12,15 34:21 34:22 38:15 Kathy's 38:18 Katz 3:12 4:4 5:24,25 50:2,6,9 54:23 55:7

55:14 56:4 57:8 keep 20:12 33:19 Kelly 3:7 5:23 Kilka 1:17 2:16 4:2,7 4:19,22,24 5:1,14 6:6 6:13 39:14 40:12 50:7 55:4 56:7 58:6 59:4,20 kind 9:8 15:21 22:11 28:12 30:14 31:25 34:2,3,24 39:6,7 52:13 kkelly@siplfirm.com 3:10 knew 16:2 know 8:9 10:12.13.17 15:11,20,23 16:2,3,3 16:19 17:6,8 18:13 20:10,10,11 21:24 22:3 24:9 29:4,6,9,10 29:12 30:14 32:20,23 35:20 36:14,15 37:15 39:13 41:23 42:1,2 43:21,22,23 45:4 46:12 47:17 48:23 49:4 52:5,16 53:12.25 54:12 55:20 knowledge 11:20 21:20 48:25 Kristi 3:7 5:22

 $\mathbf{L}$ label 11:13 laid 42:8 late 20:18,18 law 11:10 lawsuit 19:7 lawver 56:17 lawyers 11:10 16:12 learn 20:17 27:10.10 learned 27:15 led 48:1 left 32:21 39:18 49:15 Len 41:1 42:23 50:2.6 50:10,17 52:7 lenbennett@cox.net 3:5 Leonard 3:3 5:21 letter 26:15 28:4 34:8 34:13,18 35:2,3,3,19 50:5,13,23 let's 33:1 level 33:12,14 **LEVY 3:7** light 10:9 line 9:9 16:25 17:1 18:20,24 22:4 32:23 34:5 35:10 36:1

proposed 48:4
provide 18:6 32:4
provided 11:7 19:19
42:17 45:24 49:1
providing 51:25
Public 2:19 58:4,25
59:25
pull 14:18 41:10,11
pulling 30:11
purchased 32:17
purpose 23:12
push 25:18
pushed 22:5
•
put 31:5 42:8,9,10
<b>p.m</b> 1:20,20 2:23 40:7
40:11 56:6 57:13
TO.11 JO.0 J /.13

## 0

question 22:1 43:6 45:16 51:23 52:2 54:9 55:19 questioning 42:6 questions 44:15.17 54:19 55:4 56:3 quickly 7:22 28:21

R R 59:1,1 read 9:21 22:20 28:20 31:17,19 34:12,13,20 42:5 45:12 53:15 56:11,14,22 59:4 reading 31:20 35:2 51:19 58:13 realize 51:3 really 11:4 20:6 27:7 32:7 34:23 41:7 54:15 reason 22:6,6 25:2 59:9 recall 14:12 16:15 23:7 24:5,7 27:5 34:18 receive 22:1 39:1 received 14:21 27:3 34:19 51:17 recess 40:9 recognize 54:14 recollection 34:17 record 6:12 12:10 39:23 40:8,13 56:7 58:11 recorded 58:9 red 47:22,24 reduced 58:10

refer 12:3.5

referenced 11:14

references 30:19

REFERRED 4:22

referring 32:10 51:10

reflective 22:4 refreshed 34:16 regard 26:25 regarding 51:15 Registered 2:18 regurgitating 52:17 related 10:5 12:23 25:8 relationship 45:3 46:22 48:13 relationships 10:11 relative 58:16.17 relevant 44:17 relocation 7:11 remain 43:9 remains 49:18 remarkable 20:8 remember 27:7 report 8:22 9:17,21 10:10 18:18 20:25 28:23 31:15 32:25 35:25 36:4 37:11 38:9 39:1 45:3 reported 21:22 37:19 54:6 reporter 1:24 2:19 5:17 6:12 56:16 58:3 reporting 10:5 18:5,16 18:16,18 19:2,4,13,22 20:25 29:4,18 32:14 32:20 33:4 35:15 44:14 45:2.5 46:24 47:9 49:2.10.14.19 reports 8:23 14:18 30:11,13 37:12,13 38:11 53:18 represent 5:16 representative 7:18 represents 37:6 reps 33:14 34:23 request 15:3 22:1 31:5 38:3,9,14,17,22 48:21 requested 26:17 51:6 requests 12:12 requires 18:16,18 reside 42:23 resource 31:5 respective 58:15 respects 59:16 respond 18:1 34:22 52:8 responding 44:9 55:19 response 12:12 14:25 17:24 22:19 28:15 responsible 8:19 38:8 rest 40:2

Results 4:13.15.18

review 12:25 43:14

returned 47:23

56:12,14,22 RE-EXAMINATION 4:5 55:17 Richmond 1:3 2:3 5:13 ridiculous 11:25 right 7:20.24 9:4.17 10:5,22 11:2,2,7,9,10 11:16 12:5,7 13:19,22 14:17,23 15:4,8 17:6 17:8,21 18:5,7 19:12 21:10 22:9,14,18 24:12.21 25:6.17.24 27:4,21 33:8,12,13,17 35:10 36:7,8,20 37:20 38:5,6 40:4,15,21 41:12 43:19 44:2,8,15 44:16,24 47:5 48:7,10 49:10,24 50:16 51:9 51:11,18,19 53:14,16 56:2.19 role 10:7,7,10 48:12,16 roll 13:22 room 40:3,5 roughly 13:8 27:10 55:20 **RPR** 58:3 runs 16:1

 $\mathbf{S}$ S 59:2 sales 7:17.19 10:1.6 13:17 25:10 30:23 38:15.18 39:4 Sanders 3:17 6:5 Sarcasm 52:25 saving 18:25 19:13 32:7 38:6 52:14 says 11:16 14:25 15:3 17:3,21,24 26:8,15 31:14 34:7 35:1,19,24 37:9 38:2 42:17 43:8 50:4,13 54:1,3 schedule 31:21 33:16 scheduled 20:20 scope 45:3 scoring-related 9:4 se 34:19 seal 58:21 seamless 32:2 seat 40:16 second 17:20 25:14 28:5,20 30:18 31:13 31:19 34:11,14 35:22 38:2 39:8 40:11 41:1 42:5 52:7 54:23 secure 10:9

27:6 31:7,11 37:2 43:11 44:5 45:10 51:7 52:5 seeing 31:20 seen 46:11 segments 8:18 sell 8:9 9:3,22 14:14 selling 8:19 10:4 16:5 sells 8:23 9:2.19 send 16:6 28:1.8 sending 15:3 28:16 sense 43:5 45:2 sent 26:8.15 28:2 50:13 51:1,2 sentence 35:24 separate 25:7 separated 10:18 33:20 **September** 13:9 35:9 58:22 service 13:5 17:5,6 23:20 37:6 serviced 47:10 services 7:15 13:12 18:6 37:11 51:25 servicing 1:12 2:12 3:22 6:4 13:2,4 14:4 25:5 26:23 35:5,6 37:7 46:16,21 48:9,23 Servicing's 48:12 set 13:23 15:16 18:4 58:20 seven 6:25 7:1 shared 37:7 short 30:2 shorten 18:9 show 19:10 29:1 32:19 37:1 53:5 showing 53:23,24 shows 37:9 53:6 side 11:13 sign 46:7.8 signed 22:24 47:3.15 50:4,13,23 significant 42:20 signing 26:24 47:4 58:13 Simak 3:24 5:3 similar 52:1 similarly 1:7 2:7 Sir 6:11 sitting 20:19 situated 1:7 2:7

situations 52:11

**skipping** 17:9 25:13

six 46:3 53:1

34:6 49:24

slight 54:17

skip 42:12

Smithfield 25:3 sold 9:16 13:12.14.15 33:6 55:22 **solely** 51:25 solutions 1:11 2:11 3:16 5:10,25 6:15 9:6 9:18 13:15 somebody 15:15 23:16 somewhat 34:17 soon 28:7 sorry 14:25 17:25 23:24 30:3 50:2.6.9 54:21.23 sort 15:14 22:23 31:1 34:22 37:7 38:16 41:25 sorted 11:15 sound 26:11 source 18:19 19:1.3 46:23 49:19 speak 21:6 speaking 21:2 special 30:9 specific 43:19 specifically 16:15 21:2 specifics 14:11 24:7 speculating 28:9 spend 10:12 **Spiegel** 37:5,10 Spiegel/CWF 37:1 Spiegel/CWS 37:13 spoke 16:15 spoken 14:6 26:4,9 29:10.19 spots 28:11 Springhouse 54:2 SS 58:2 stack 10:16,18,19,20,22 11:6 23:23 25:13 27:6 46:12,13 stage 41:21 standard 5:5 40:8 56:8 stapled 10:20 start 10:24 32:13,20 40:11 51:23 started 29:4 42:6 starting 13:20 starts 13:9 56:15 57:2 state 6:11 stated 58:8 statement 21:22 States 1:1 2:1 5:11 statistical 9:3 status 53:25 stenographically 58:9 step 18:9 41:5 steps 45:7 Steve 3:24 5:2

15:1 16:24 18:9 27:6

see 11:19 12:17 14:19

				_
1 4 4 4 5			1	1
1-4 4:15	3:11cv00624 1:8 2:8			]
1-8 5:1	<b>3:26</b> 40:7			
10 4:24	3:36 40:11			
11:09 51:17	30 39:21			
14 39:18	<b>31st</b> 2:21			
<b>143</b> 12:5 14:1				
144 36:22	4			
•	4 4:13 53:8			
151 23:25				
<b>15219</b> 2:22 5:8	4-5 4:12,23			i
<b>163</b> 17:10,11,12 22:15	4:01 56:6			
164 17:21	<b>4:03</b> 1.20 57:13			
169 23:23	<b>4:30</b> 28:7	·		
170 23:24	4010 3:8			
174 29:24	4500 5:7			
175 30:19				
176 31:10	5			
179 37:22	5 4:9,10,12,13,15,15,16			]
189 23:23	4:18,19			
<b>198</b> 40:18,21	500 5:7			
130 40.10,21	1			
2	51 3:13			
	53 4:23			
<b>2</b> 4:10	<b>55</b> 4:4,5			
<b>2:39</b> 1:20 2:23				
2:39:06 5:4	6			
200.3:8	6 4:3,16			
2000 3:19	6th 58:21			
20001 3:13	<b>62</b> 4:12			
2010 13:9 35:7,9 40:23				
45:9	7			
2012 1:18 2:22 5:4	7 4:18			
58:22 59:5,22	703.277.9774 3:9			
	<b>757.687.7765</b> 3:20			
202 42:12,16 43:8				
202.879.3939 3:14	<b>757.930.3660</b> 3:5			
207 43:25 45:9	763 3:3			
208 44:2				
<b>213</b> 46:3	8			1
22030 3:9	8 4:19,24 10:25 11:5,5			
<b>222</b> 3:18 25:13,18	22:15			
<b>223</b> 25:18	<b>8:29</b> 17:21			
23462 3:19				
23601 3:4	9	,		
<b>239</b> 25:19 28:14	96 4:15			
<b>24</b> 1:18 2:22 5:4 53:8				
53:10 59:5				
<b>240</b> 28:5				
•				
<b>241</b> 25:25				
<b>243</b> 34:7				
<b>249</b> 50:19,25				
<b>250</b> 50:22				
<b>252</b> 51:13				
<b>256</b> 49:25 50:7				
<b>257</b> 4:20				
<b>27</b> 40:23				
3				
3 4:9,10,12,16,23 53:2				
53:10,10				
<b>3:06</b> 40:23				
1	i l		I	